

# “The Literal Zone: Exhibits A–J”

Andrej Slavik

1

2

3

4

92

---

1 See Abounaddara, “We are not artists / نينانف انسل / Nous ne sommes pas des artistes”, April 6, 2017, [www.facebook.com/notes/aboutaddara-films/we-are-not-artists-نينانف-انسل-nous-ne-sommes-pas-des-artistes/1417934858267217](http://www.facebook.com/notes/aboutaddara-films/we-are-not-artists-نينانف-انسل-nous-ne-sommes-pas-des-artistes/1417934858267217), and cf., e.g., Katarina Nitsch, “Världigheten och den värdelösa bilden”, *Walden: tidskrift för filmkritik* 7/8 (2017); Stefan Tarnowski, “What have we been watching? What have we been watching?”, May 5, 2017, [bidayyat.org/opinions\\_article.php?id=167#.WtBbH2aavnU](http://bidayyat.org/opinions_article.php?id=167#.WtBbH2aavnU). (All online sources accessed April 13, 2018 unless otherwise noted.)

2 On the notion of regulative ideas, see Immanuel Kant, *Critique of Pure Reason*, trans. Paul Guyer and Allen W. Wood (Cambridge University Press, 1998), 590–1: A642/B670–A645/B673, and cf. Gary Banham, “Regulative Principles and Regulative Ideas”, [www.garybanham.net/PAPERS\\_files/Regulative%20Principles%20and%20Regulative%20Ideas.pdf](http://www.garybanham.net/PAPERS_files/Regulative%20Principles%20and%20Regulative%20Ideas.pdf). As for the question of methodology, see, e.g., Carlo Ginzburg, “Clues: Roots of an Evidential Paradigm”, in *Clues, Myths, and the Historical Method* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1989), and cf. Andrej Slávik, “Microhistory Goes Public: From Ginzburg’s paradigma indiziario to Weizman’s Forensic Turn”, in *Microhistories*, eds Magnus Bårtås and Andrej Slávik (Stockholm: Konstfack, 2016).

3 Frédéric Boissonnas, *Smyrne*, L’Image de la Grèce (Geneva: Éditions d’Art Boissonnas, 1919), *passim*. On the photographic expedition, see Nicolas Bouvier, *Boissonnas: une dynastie de photographes, 1864–1983* (Lausanne: Payot, 1983), 109–50, 167. However, Bouvier’s statement that “[l]’album sur Smyrne n’est pas sorti depuis un an que la ville est reprise et brûlée par les Turcs” (167) is not accurate: the book appeared in 1919, the city was ‘retaken’ only in 1922. The example of Smyrna is also the subject of a recent compilation film: see [www.smyrnadocumentary.org](http://www.smyrnadocumentary.org).

4 UCLA Film and Television Archive footage from the 1938 Évian Conference, available on the website of the United States Holocaust Memorial Museum, accessed April 13, 2018, [www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/media\\_fi.php?ModuleId=0&Mediald=185](http://www.ushmm.org/wlc/en/media_fi.php?ModuleId=0&Mediald=185).

---

5 M. S. Randhawa, *Out of the Ashes: An Account of the Rehabilitation of Refugees from West Pakistan in Rural Areas of East Punjab* ([Chandigarh?]: Public Relations Department, Punjab, [1954]), plate [3] (facing p. 26). On the aerial view as a visual trope, see Benjamin Thomas White, “Images of refugee camps, part 1: aerial views”, February 21, 2016, [singularthings.wordpress.com/2016/02/21/images-of-refugee-camps-part-1-aerial-views](http://singularthings.wordpress.com/2016/02/21/images-of-refugee-camps-part-1-aerial-views).

6 At the time of writing, the images for this episode have not been definitively selected. According to official figures, there were still well over 50 000 DPs in European camps in 1957: see William Maley, *What Is a Refugee?* (London: Hurst & Company, 2016), 87. The Föhrenwald camp is the subject of two recent graduate theses: Alexandra M. Kramen, “Indefinite displacement: Post-Holocaust Jewish refugee experiences, community, and life in displaced persons camp Föhrenwald, 1945–1957” (master’s thesis, West Chester University of Pennsylvania, 2015); and Alexander McPherson, “In the Wilderness at Föhrenwald: Jewish Refugees in Occupied Upper Bavaria, 1945–47” (master’s thesis, Trent University, 2016).

7 On the tension between past and present, see Enzo Traverso, *Le passé, mode d’emploi: histoire, mémoire, politique* (Paris: Fabrique, 2005). Regarding the corresponding relation between history and anthropology, see, e.g., Marc Augé *An Anthropology for Contemporaneous Worlds* (Stanford University Press, 1999).

8 Most importantly, “video: Funeral of Mohamed Bouazizi *مدحمة عزانج يوزيذ عوبلا ...*”, posted by Nawaat, January 5, 2011, [www.youtube.com/watch?v=YSl4nrMXgKw](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YSl4nrMXgKw), and “Raw Video: Egyptian Sets Self on Fire”, posted by Associated Press, January 17, 2011, [www.youtube.com/watch?v=vWKzsty\\_U4U](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=vWKzsty_U4U). (The footage of Thich Quang Duc has been appropriated from “Self-Immolation as a Political Tool (Dispatch)”, posted by STRATFORvideo, January 18, 2011, [www.youtube.com/watch?v=mEKwU\\_B\\_n\\_M](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=mEKwU_B_n_M).) Regarding the Tunisian context, cf. Robert Mackey, “Video That Set Off Tunisia’s Uprising”, January 22, 2011, [thelede.blogs.nytimes.com/2011/01/22/video-that-triggered-tunisia-uprising](http://thelede.blogs.nytimes.com/2011/01/22/video-that-triggered-tunisia-uprising). A brief but thought-provoking assessment of the political protest movements on both shores of the Mediterranean is offered by Leila Nachawati, “The Mediterranean Spring”, translated and adapted by John Postill, March 9, 2014, [johnpostill.com/2014/09/03/the-mediterranean-spring](http://johnpostill.com/2014/09/03/the-mediterranean-spring).

9 “Cesedi Bodrum’da kıyıya vuran 3 yaşındaki Suriyeli mülteci Aylan Kurdi”, posted by Şakir YILDIZ, September 3, 2015, [www.youtube.com/watch?v=eyBLESLm4sQ](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eyBLESLm4sQ). Regarding the passage “again – and then again – and then again...”, cf. Ruben Andersson, *Illegality, Inc.: Clandestine Migration and the Business of Bordering Europe* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2014), 1: “a broadcast set on repeat at the faultline between continents” (pertaining to Ceuta and Melilla).

10 “Demolition of Calais refugee camp (streamed live)”, posted by RT, October 27, 2016, [www.youtube.com/watch?v=tfjgtRW12Fk](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=tfjgtRW12Fk). On the transit center in Sangatte, see Didier Fassin, *Humanitarian Reason: A Moral History of the Present* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012), ch. 5. (Formally, Sangatte was classified as a *Centre d’Hébergement et d’Accueil d’Urgence Humanitaire*, but the term *centre de transit* was also used, even by the French Red Cross themselves: see Pierre Kremer, “Sangatte: L’espoir au bout du tunnel”, *Croix-Rouge, Croissant-Rouge*, no. 2 (2002), [www.red-cross.int/FR/magazine2002\\_2/sangatte.html](http://www.red-cross.int/FR/magazine2002_2/sangatte.html).) A documentary about the center is available online: *Sangatte, station balnéaire* (Nadia Bouferkas, Benjamin Durand, Nicolas Potin, and Wasila Zahzouma, 2002), [vimeo.com/37976568](http://vimeo.com/37976568). Regarding the passage “nothing but transit”, cf., e.g., Avi Davis, “Grande-Synthe: The humanitarian camp that France didn’t want”, *France 24*, March 26, 2016, [webdoc.france24.com/france-first-humanitarian-camp-grande-synthe](http://webdoc.france24.com/france-first-humanitarian-camp-grande-synthe). (Ironically, the camp in Grande-Synthe – also known by the name of La Linière – was devastated by a fire only a year after its construction.)

11 At this point in my argument, I must insist – *contra* Charif Kiwan (personal communication, April 13, 2018) – on the notion of indignation: cf. Stéphane Hessel, *Indignez-vous!* (Montpellier: Indigène, 2010) and note 8 above.

12 Joel Koteck and Pierre Rigoulot, *Le siècle des camps: détention, concentration, extermination: cent ans de mal radical* (Paris: Lattès, 2000), passim. The passage “terrible, unbearable images” is a quote from the back cover of the book.

13 “Breaking: Oil Still Leaking: BP Oil Spill Cam”, posted by BaguaChannel, August 24, 2010, [www.youtube.com/watch?v=WdW3VsSnb08](http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=WdW3VsSnb08). On the source of the footage (which is, in fact, unverified), see T. J. Demos, *Against the Anthropocene: Visual Culture and Environment Today* (Berlin: Sternberg Press, 2017), 32–7, and, for the technical details, Joel Achenbach, *A Hole at the Bottom of the Sea: The Race to Kill the BP Oil Gusher* (New York: Simon & Schuster, 2011), 166 and ch. 11.

14 See, in the first place, Siegfried Kracauer, *History: The Last Things Before the Last* (Princeton: Wiener, 1995 [1969]). On ‘history as a spiritual fact’, see Ernst Cassirer, *The Logic of the Cultural Sciences: Five Studies* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000), 12, and cf. Andrej Slávik, “What Is History and Why Do I Write It: Aftershocks of the Contemporary Past”, in *Architecture, Photography, and the Contemporary Past*, eds Claes Caldenby, Andrej Slávik, Julia Tedroff, and Martin Farran-Lee (Stockholm: Art & Theory, 2014), 167. Regarding ‘photography’s incapacity for abstraction’, see Allan Sekula, “Photography and the Limits of National Identity”, *Grey Room* 55 (Spring 2014), 31. Kluge’s notion of ‘antagonistic realism’ is also highly pertinent in this regard: see Oskar Negt and Alexander Kluge, *Geschichte und Eigensinn* (Frankfurt am Main: Zweitausendeins, 1981), 348, cit. Fredric Jameson, “On Negt and Kluge”, *October* 46 (1988), 151 (“You can imagine the problem of antagonistic realism in terms of the analysis of the site of an explosion. The explosion scattered objects across a wide area. The force of the explosion, in other words, what really moved, is no longer present [...]”).

15 Used postcards acquired through the Italian version of eBay. The quote is from Carlo Ginzburg, “Calvino, Manzoni e la zona grigia”, [www.primolevi.it/@api/deki/files/1227/=MAUSC\\_000013.pdf](http://www.primolevi.it/@api/deki/files/1227/=MAUSC_000013.pdf), the translation (modified) from “Calvino, Manzoni and the gray zone”, [www.primolevi.it/@api/deki/files/1229/=MAUSC\\_E00007.pdf](http://www.primolevi.it/@api/deki/files/1229/=MAUSC_E00007.pdf). Cf. idem, “Microhistory: Two or Three Things That I Know About It”, in *Threads and Traces: True, False, Fictive* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2012), 197. The name of the hotel – or *albergo* – is mentioned in Giorgio Manganelli, *Estrosità rigorose di un consulente editoriale* (Milan: Adelphi, 2016), II:1, letter 4, note 11. More obviously relevant visuals can be found in Luca Baranelli and Francesco Ciafaloni, *Una stanza all’Einaudi*, ed. Alberto Saibene (Macerata: Quodlibet, 2013), and Giulio Bollati, *Intermittenze del ricordo: immagini di cultura italiana*, ed. Rosa Tamborrino (Turin: Fondazione Musei, 2006).

16 See, e.g., Jacques Rancière, “De la vérité des récits au partage des âmes”, *Critique* 769–770 (2011), and cf. Georges Didi-Huberman (with Pedro G. Romero), “Un conocimiento por el montaje”, *Minerva* 5 (2007), [www.circulobellasartes.com/revistaminerva/articulo.php?id=141](http://www.circulobellasartes.com/revistaminerva/articulo.php?id=141). This question, however, is not so simple, as would surely be demonstrated by a comparison between, e.g., Jacques Rancière, “Are Some Things Unrepresentable?”, in *The Future of the Image* (London: Verso, 2007), esp. 125, and Carlo Ginzburg, “Reflections on a Blank”, in *History, Rhetoric, and Proof* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1999). For this discussion, a useful point of departure is María Eugenia Chaves Maldonado, “El anacronismo en la historia: ¿error o posibilidad? A propósito de las reflexiones sobre el tiempo en Carlo Ginzburg, Marc Bloch y Georges Didi-Huberman”, *Historia y sociedad* 30 (2016), [dx.doi.org/10.15446/hys.n30.52609](https://doi.org/10.15446/hys.n30.52609).